ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS - THE SELECTIVE $CO₂$ Reduction Challenge

HARRY ATWATER

JOINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS ISF-2

July 8th 2017

JCAP MISSION MISSION

JCAP MISSION

JCAP'S FIRST PHASE: SOLAR FUELS FOR WATER-SPLITTING

JCAP: SOLAR FUELS GENERATORS

JCAP'S FIRST PHASE: SOLAR FUELS FOR WATER-SPLITTING

Oxide-Protected Photoanode Device:

A >10% efficient, stable, unassisted solar-driven water-splitting in a monolithic photoelectrochemical system integrating

- protected tandem junction photoabsorbers,
- earth-abundant electrocatalysts, and
- anion exchange membranes.

CX Xiang and Erik Verlage assemble a monolithically integrated III-V device, protected by a TiO² stabilization layer, which performs unassisted solar water splitting with hydrogen fuel and oxygen

Catalytic Grid Photocathode Device:

E. Verlage, S. Hu, R. Liu, R. J. R. Jones, K. Sun, C. Xiang, N. S. Lewis, Harry A. Atwater, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015. K.A. Walczak, G.Segev, D.M. Larson, J.W. Beeman, F.A. Houle, and I.D. Sharp, *Adv. Energy Mater. ,*2017.

STATE OF THE ART FOR PEC HYDROGEN GENERATION – 2015 ◇ **U.** Tokyo $500 \mathrm{sun}$ **Reported Solar to Hydrogen Conversion Efficiencies** Monash U. \diamondsuit 20 PV and catalyst configuration **Technion** 2J, integrated PVs and catalysts O 18 \Box 2J, integrated PVs, wired catalyst ♦ 2J, series connected PVs or catalysts П 16 Fraunhofer ISE U. Tokyo **NREL** 10 suns 500 suns Reported STH efficiency (%) 3J, integrated PVs and catalysts >15% Δ 3J, integrated PVs, wired catalyst ◁ **Faunhofer/JCAI** 4 3J, series connected PVs or catalysts ᢦ $\mathcal{C}^{\mathcal{A}}$ 12 PV materials **NREL** 11 suns *With* $>10\%$ All III-V **JCAP** *membrane* 10 partial III-V **JCAP JCAP** *s* All silicon U. Hawaii natural sunlight 8 partial Si Oxides and other Texas A&M **JGAP**
LBNL/UCB_p nanowires **NREL GM** 6 $>5%$ **Texas A&M** Delft/HZB Sun Catalytix/MIT Delft/HZB **EINIRICERCHE** Delft/HZB 4 **Texas A&M RITE Kyoto NTU** Osaka U **UT Austin** ◇ Osaka Sun Catalytix/MIT 2

2000

NTEGRATED SOLAR FUELS **GENERATORS** GENERATORS

International Contract

U. Hawaii

2005

2016

OINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS

JCAP

UC Berkeley

2010

nanowires A

CalTech

Ager, JCAP T3, 10/7/15 - 2

mi rowires

Ager, Shaner, Walczak, Sharp, Ardo, Energy and Environmental Science, 2015, 8, 2811

1990

1995

Texas A&M

1985

Allied Chem.

1975

0

Flinders

1980

$$
V_{PEC}(j) = \frac{2}{d} V_{PV_i}(j) - V_{cat,a}(j) - V_{cat,c}(j) - V_{series}(j)^{3} E_{rxn}
$$

PV Voltage:
$$
V_{pV}(j) = \frac{n_d k_B T}{q} \ln \frac{\mathfrak{g}}{\mathfrak{g}} \frac{j}{j_0} + 1 \frac{\mathfrak{g}}{\mathfrak{g}}
$$
 Catalyst Voltage: $V_{cat}(j) = \frac{RT}{\mathfrak{g}n_e F} \sinh^{-1} \frac{\mathfrak{g}}{\mathfrak{g}} \frac{j}{2j_{0,cat}}$

Device operating point: $V_{op}(j_{op})=E_{rxn}$

Water splitting PEC efficiency:
$$
h_{PEC} = \frac{j_{op} E_{rxn} f_{FE}}{P_{in}}
$$

ö
÷
Ø

Ö

÷

REALISTIC PERFORMANCE LIMITS FOR PEC HYDROGEN GENERATION

- Absorption of 90% of incident photons above the bandgap of the semiconductor
- An external radiative efficiency (ERE) of 3% (typical III-V)
- Catalytic exchange current densities of 1 mA \cdot cm⁻² (HER)and 10⁻³ mA \cdot cm⁻² (OER); consistent with the best reported values for Pt and IrO₂
- Diode ideality factor, n_{d} , of 1.
- The electrochemical potential for water-splitting at standard conditions, *Erxn*=1.23 V.
- Unity Faradaic efficiency.

Fountaine, Lewerenz, Atwater Nature Communications (2016)

CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS

McCrory et al, JACS 137 (2015) 4347; *ibid* 135 (2013) 16977

International Contract

MATERIALS SELECTION: PHOTOELECTRODES

A.Polman, M. Knight, E.C. Garnett, B. Erhler and W.C. Sinke, Science (2016)

19.3% STH EFFICIENCY INTEGRATED PEC DEVICE

W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*

19.3% STH EFFICIENCY INTEGRATED PEC DEVICE

W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*

RAPID ADVANCES IN EFFICIENCY OF INTEGRATED STH PECS

Dual junction limiting efficiency

W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*

International Contract NTEGRATED SOLAR FUELS GENERATORS GENERATORS

UNASSISTED WATER SPLITTING WITH BIPOLAR MEMBRANE AT 10% ENERGY CONVERSION EFFICIENCY

All earth-abundant electrocatalysts: NiO_x for OER in the KBi buffer and CoP_x for HER in 1.0 M H₂SO₄.

- \cdot > 1.0 cm², > 10% STH conversion efficiency, >100 hour stability was achieved using a tandem photoabsorber in a cell configuration that incorporates a bipolar membrane.
- The acid stable electrocatalyst, CoP, was successfully integrated into the cell.

Bipolar membrane:

- near-unity transference numbers for proton and hydroxide transport at relatively high operational current densities
- ~400-500 mV voltage loss due to ohmic resistance, water dissociation and water transport processes, further improvements can be made by incorporating water dissociation catalysts at the interface.

K. Sun, R. Liu, E. Verlage, N. S. Lewis, C. Xiang, E&ES (2016)

SOLAR-DRIVEN REDUCTION OF CO² TO FORMATE AT 10% ENERGY CONVERSION EFFICIENCY

Schematic illustration of the series connected photoanode and dark cathode for CO_2 reduction to formate

Best combination of catholyte and anolyte to achieve the lowest total overpotential for the device **Minimal product crossovers even at high formate concentration**

- **Photoanode: InGaP/GaAs/TiO² /NiO^x at pH=14 electrolyte previously used for solar water-splitting.**
- **Dark cathode: Pd/C nanoparticles on Ti mesh in pH=8 bicarbonate solution achieved ≤ 100 mV overpotential and >94% Faradaic efficiency at 10 mA cm-2 .**
- **Bipolar membrane sustained the steady-state pH differential and minimized the product crossovers.**

CX Xiang, et.al. ACS Energy Lett., 2016, 1, pp 764–770

RELATIVE SCALE OF EMISSIONS AND POTENTIAL USES FOR CO 2

Current emissions:

Some possible non-atmospheric ends:

GtC = 1 billion metric tons of carbon equivalent, i.e. 1Gt MeOH = 12.01/(12.01+16.00+4*1.01) Gt = 0.37 GtC.

¹ Assuming cement is composed of CaCO3, and the aggregate is composed of 50% CaCO3 by mass \cdot ² Assuming a steel substitute that is similar in composition to carbon fiber, i.e. 90% C by mass. ³ Assuming cement is composed of CaCO3 · ⁴ Estimated feasible scale-up rates by 2050, excluding geoengineering approaches. Shaded bars indicate the upper range of estimates.

THE CO² UTILIZATION LANDSCAPE

- Focus on processes able to capture, reduce or sequester 1 GtCO₂/yr scale
- **1 of the top 5 Priorities: Synthetic Transformations of CO²**
- **Recommendations:**
	- **Reduce the cost of carbon-free/neutral energy in the form of heat/electricity**
	- **Focus on fundamentals of electrocatalysis and photoelectrocatalysis**
	- **Identify catalysts made of abundant elements that reduce the overpotentials for CO2RR and OER at high reaction rates.**

Secretary of Energy Advisory Board Report, 12/13/2016

THE CO² UTILIZATION LANDSCAPE

ROUTES TO FUELS FROM CO² : COMPARING APPROACHES

Advantages:

Mature technology; heat only required as energy input

Disadvantages:

High capital cost and intrinsically large-scale for plant; efficiency < 100%

Room temperature operation, high FE and throughput for certain products (e.g., CO, HCOO-)

Limited throughput, low selectivity and STF efficiency for alkane and alcohol fuels

Low capital cost, scalable, uses sunlight as direct energy input

Low efficiency and selectivity, product separation

Low capital cost; near room temperature; near neutral pH operation

Limited durability (bacteria die after 30 days); limited pH range, low throughput

WHY NOT JUST MAKE CO AND H2 AND USE THERMOCHEMISTRY TO DO THE REST?

- High capital cost for thermochemical plant
- Fischer-Tropsch thermal conversion efficiency 50-60%
- Requires source of hydrogen using process other than steam reforming (PEC water splitting technology development ongoing)

Japanese Gas to Liquids Pilot Plant, Niigata City, Japan

Production scale: 500 barrels/day

JCAP aims for direct, selective CO2R catalysis strategies under mild P & T conditions that have potential for scalable production of fuels from sunlight with low capital cost.

CHEMICAL SYNTHESES FROM SYNGAS AND METHANOL

- Many chemical conversions from syngas to products, including gasoline via Fischer-Tropsch
- Many chemical conversions from methanol to products, including gasoline
- Methanol is an achievable product from $CO₂R$ PEC

Source: P.L. Spath and D.C. Dayton, Preliminary screening-technical and economic assessment of synthesis gas to fuels and chemicals with emphasis on the potential for biomas-derived syngas, National Renewable Energy Laboratory, NREL/TP-510-34929, December, 2003.

Kuhl, Cave, Abram, Jaramillo Energy Environ. Sci. 5, 7050 (2012).

Selectivity is a major issue: Competition with HER

POSSIBLE PATHWAYS FOR CO² REDUCTION CATALYSIS ON COPPER

SCALING RELATIONSHIPS FOR CO² INTERMEDIATES ON CU

Adsorption energies of the key bound intermediates on fcc Cu (211)

Adsorption energies of adsorbates binding through oxygen

Peterson and Nørskov, J Phys Chem Lett., 3, 251–25 (2012).

$\bm{\mathsf{C}}$ ELECTIVE CO_2 REDUCTION

OVERCOMING SCALING RELATIONSHIPS FOR CO² REDUCTION

THEORY DEVELOPMENTS

EXPERIMENTAL DEVELOPMENTS 30% E_x

40%

 $\bm{\mathsf{C}}$

ARTIFICIAL PHOTO

E LECTROLYTE SELECTION: CHOICE OF CATION

Use of CsHCO³ buffer increases FE to C2+ products (ethanol, ethylene) on Cu foil

−1.0 V vs RHE in CO₂-saturated 0.1 M MHCO $_3$

Singh, M. R.; Kwon, Y.; Lum, Y.; Ager, J. W.; Bell, A. T. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **2016**, 138, 13006–13012. Also: Murata, A.; Hori, Y. *Bull. Chem. Soc. Jpn*. **1991**, 64, 123–127.

Scientific Achievement

Identified tandem, bimetallic catalysts for the preferential formation of H_2COO over H_2 .

Significance and Impact

Selective reduction of CO₂ to H₂COO can be achieved by embedding metal atoms that favor CORR over HER in a host metal that favors CO_2 reduction to CO. The CORR catalyst must bind *CHO (or *COH) more tightly than *H

Research Details

DFT/RPBE/APW was used to calculate the free energy of activation for all elementary steps in CO2 reduction to CO on Au(111) or Ag(111) surfaces and the reduction of CO to H2CO vs H2 on Cu, Ni, Pd, Pt , Co, Rh, and Ir atoms embedded in the host metal surface.

CORR ΔG ***CHO** or ΔG ***COH** $\leq \Delta G$

Gold (or Silver)

 $CO_{2(q)}$ **CO**_(g) **CH**_{4(g)} **or CH**₃**OH**_(aq)

M = Cu, Ni, Pd, Pt, Co, Rh, Ir

1.0

ELECTROCHEMICAL REDUCTION OF CO² SELECTIVELY TO METHANOL ^S

Near-Surface Alloy for Selective Reduction of CO_2 to CH_3OH

A theoretical prediction: a near-surface alloy (NSA) of a monolayer of Au on bulk W was empirically found to generate CH3OH to the *exclusion* of other hydrocarbons and alcohols.

Approach

- Combined density-functional theory and adsorptionenergy descriptors ΔG°_{cO}, ΔG°_H and ΔG°_{OH} predicted a Au-W-Au NSA that would be $CH₃OH-product-selective.$
- Overlayer NSA films of (0.5 to 3 ML) Au on W were prepared by controlled galvanostatic deposition.

Electrode Lid Spacer Cell body Vacuum Membrane Steel frit 10^{-3} mb. **QMS** $10⁻⁵$ mbar

Products from CO² reduction at -1.2 V(RHE) in 0.1 M KHCO₃ were analyzed by Differential Electrochemical Mass Spectrometry (DEMS). Only CH3OH was found.

Constant-potential DEMS of CO² Reduction on Au-W Near-Surface Alloy

Future Work:

Prepare NSA as prescribed by theory Try different substrates with the same NSA Obtain complete and quantitative product analysis Have theory scrutinized by other theory groups

A. Javier, J. H. Baricuatro, Y.-G. Kim and M. P. Soriaga*. "Au-on-W Near-Surface Alloy as a $CH₃OH-Product-Selective Electrocatalyst for CO₂ Reduction: Empirical (DEMS) Confirmation of a$ Computational (DFT) Prediction." *Electrocatalysis*, **6** 495. (2015).

Energy & Environmental Science 5, 7050 (2012)**.**

EPITAXIAL GROWTH USING PHYSICAL VAPOR DEPOSITION

D. B. Knorr and T.-M. Lu, *Textures and Microstructures*, **1991**, 13, 155-164.

B. G. Demczyk, R. Naik, G. Auner, C. Kota and U. Rao, *Journal of Applied Physics*, **1994**, 75, 1956-1961. I. Hashim, B. Park, and H.A. Atwater, *Applied Physics Letters*, **1993**, 63, 2833-2835.

C. Hahn, T. Hatsukade, Y.G. Kim, A. Vallionis, J.H. Baricuatro, D.C. Higgins, S. Nitopi, M.P. Soriaga and T.F. Jaramillo*,* PNAS, **2017**.

EFFECTS OF SURFACE STRUCTURE ON C-C COUPLING SELECTIVITY

C-C coupling is favored on under-coordinated sites. Epitaxial Cu thin films are single-crystal analogous for C-C coupling selectivity.

C. Hahn, T. Hatsukade, Y.G. Kim, A. Vallionis, J.H. Baricuatro, D.C. Higgins, S. Nitopi, M.P. Soriaga and T.F. Jaramillo*,* PNAS, **2017**.

Cu(751) has the lowest number of nearest neighbors, and is the least likely to have adsorbed H* adjacent to C2 intermediates. PCET instead of hydride transfer leads to less structure sensitivity.

OECSTM: C^U RECONSTRUCTION AT CO2R CONDITIONS (-0.9 V/0.1 *M* **KOH)**

Y.-G. Kim, J. H. Baricuatro, A. Javier and M. P. Soriaga, J.Electroanal. Chem. **780** pp 290-295 (2106)

REGULATING CO-REDUCTION SELECTIVITY BY CONTROL OF SURFACE STRUCTURE

Ethanol-product Selectivity of Post-ORC Cu(pc)-[Cu(100)] at -1.0 V in 0.1 M KOH

CO-to- C_2H_5 OH on Cu(511)

 $\bm{\mathsf{C}}$

Y.-G. Kim, J. H. Baricuatro, A. Javier and M. P. Soriaga, J.Electroanal. Chem. **780** pp 290-295 (2106)

HIGH THROUGHPUT DISCOVERY OF PHOTOANODES

Electrocatalyst screening

Library

synthesis

Energy (eV)

Light-absorber screening

Characterization

Data informatics and distribution

Theory + HiTp **Computation**

 1.0

 0.8

o.

a

Phase fraction

Phase fraction

 0.0

Blossite

Design Materials & Interface with MP Database

Joint project with the Materials Project to design photoanodes and identify candidate materials.

High Throughput Computation

Judicious choice of functional to rapidly evaluate the electronic structure and Pourbaix stability of hundreds of materials

Fingerite, Cu₁₁V₆O₂₆ McBirneyite, γ -Cu₃V₂O₈ Blossite, α -Cu₂V₂O₇

High Throughput Experimentation Identify synthesis conditions, generate composition maps of optical and photoelectrochemical properties.

McBirnevite

L. Zhou, Q. Yan, A. Shinde, D. Guevarra, P. F. Newhouse, N. Becerra-Stasiewicz, J. B. Neaton, J. M. Gregoire, Adv. Energy Mater. 5, 1500968 (2015).

HIGH THROUGHPUT DISCOVERY OF PHOTOANODES: INTEGRATED THEORY-EXPERIMENT PIPELINE

Stitching complementary techniques together accelerates hypothesis-based discoveries

Pipeline execution summary:

- Out of the 15 hits there are 12 discoveries (3 of 15 were already reported)
- The 88% hit rate upon successful synthesis provides credence to the design criteria and the computational workflow
- These experimentally-verified predictions foundationally demonstrate that high throughput computation can accelerate experimental discovery of functional materials.

• Varying the electronic band character in complex oxides enables tuning of the band gap energy and band positions.

Q. Yan, et.al. (Persson, Gregoire, Neaton) *PNAS*, 114 3040-3043 (2017).

INTEGRATION NTEGRATION

BIPHASIC OER CATALYST INTEGRATED ON SI

More Co(OH)2 component increases with increasing photoelectron take-off angle surface layer:

Onset potential for water oxidation of <1V versus RHE and a saturation current density of 37.5 mA/cm² :

No detectable transfer of Co from the film into solution after 72 hr.

J. Yang, et.al. (Toma, Yano, Sharp) *Nature Materials*, 114 3040-3043 (2017).

PROTOTYPING ROTOTYPING

MEMBRANELESS FLOW CELL PROTOTYPE FOR SEPARATIONS

A new electrochemical CO² test bed implements isolates the fuel-containing electrolyte produced at the cathode from the anode and produces a stream of liquid products.

Cell design validated with 2-D Multiphysics modeling and experimentally implemented.

Separation efficiency as high as 90% demonstrated.

Monroe, M. M.; Lobaccaro, P.; Lum, Y.; Ager, J. W., *J. Phys. D. Appl. Phys. 50*, 154006 (2017).

Overall Faradaic efficiency (sum of both channels) for formate production with 01 M KHCO₃ electrolyte saturated in $CO₂$ and Sn cathode at 5 mA/cm².

Goulet, M.A.; Kjeang, E*. J. of Power Sources*. 2014, *260*, 186-196. Ismagilov, R.F.; Stroock, A.D.; Kenis, P.J.A.; et al. *Appl. Phys. Letters.* 2000, *76,* 2376-2378.

MULTIPHYSICS MODELING: VIRTUAL INTEGRATOR AND TESTING PLATFORM

- \Im 20 mA/cm² is feasible with 1 atm CO₂ or equivalent high concentration locally
- $\hat{\varphi}$ For aqueous: pH 7.5 to 8.5 shows lowest total losses while maintaining selectivity towards CO₂ reduction

Key is local CO² concentration

M. R. Singh, E.L. Clark, A.T. Bell, doi: 10.1039/C5CP03283K

- A strategy for selective $EC-CO_2$ reduction: multifunctional cathode that combines multiple active sites, functional coatings, nanoscale confining volumes
- Mechanism discovery: initial focus predominantly on Cu and Cu alloys
- Materials discovery:
	- bimetallic alloy candidates screened and synthesized
	- oxide photoanode theory/experimental effort achieves high predictive yield
- Integration focus on OER (– biphasic cobalt oxide)
- Prototyping: device architectures for EC and PEC CO2RR

