ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS—THE SELECTIVE CO₂ REDUCTION CHALLENGE



HARRY ATWATER

JOINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS ISF-2

July 8th 2017





JCAP MISSION





JCAP'S FIRST PHASE: SOLAR FUELS FOR WATER-SPLITTING





JCAP: SOLAR FUELS GENERATORS



JCAP'S FIRST PHASE: SOLAR FUELS FOR WATER-SPLITTING

Oxide-Protected

Photoanode Device:

A >10% efficient, stable, unassisted solar-driven water-splitting in a monolithic photoelectrochemical system integrating

- protected tandem junction photoabsorbers,
- earth-abundant electrocatalysts, and
- anion exchange membranes.





CX Xiang and Erik Verlage assemble a monolithically integrated III-V device, protected by a TiO₂ stabilization layer, which performs unassisted solar water splitting with hydrogen fuel and oxygen

Catalytic Grid Photocathode Device:



E. Verlage, S. Hu, R. Liu, R. J. R. Jones, K. Sun, C. Xiang, N. S. Lewis, Harry A. Atwater, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015. K.A. Walczak, G.Segev, D.M. Larson, J.W. Beeman, F.A. Houle, and I.D. Sharp, *Adv. Energy Mater.*, 2017.



STATE OF THE ART FOR PEC HYDROGEN GENERATION – 2015 Reported Solar to Hydrogen Conversion Efficiencies



JOINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS

$$V_{PEC}(j) = \mathop{a}_{i} V_{PV_{i}}(j) - V_{cat,a}(j) - V_{cat,c}(j) - V_{series}(j) ^{3} E_{rxn}$$

PV Voltage: $V_{PV}(j)$

$$) = \frac{n_d k_B T}{q} \ln \frac{\partial}{\partial} \frac{j}{j_0} + 1 \frac{\ddot{0}}{\dot{g}} \qquad \text{Catalyst Voltage: } V_{cat}(j) = \frac{RT}{\partial n_e F} \sinh^{-1} \frac{\partial}{\partial} \frac{j}{2j_{0,cat}} \frac{\ddot{0}}{\dot{g}}$$

Device operating point: $V_{op}(j_{op})=E_{rxn}$

Water splitting PEC efficiency:
$$h_{PEC} = \frac{J_{op}E_{rxn}f_{FE}}{P_{in}}$$



REALISTIC PERFORMANCE LIMITS FOR PEC HYDROGEN GENERATION

- Absorption of 90% of incident photons above the bandgap of the semiconductor
- An external radiative efficiency (ERE) of 3% (typical III-V)
- Catalytic exchange current densities of 1 mA·cm⁻² (HER)and 10⁻³ mA·cm⁻² (OER); consistent with the best reported values for Pt and IrO₂
- Diode ideality factor, n_d , of 1.
- The electrochemical potential for water-splitting at standard conditions, E_{rxn} =1.23 V.
- Unity Faradaic efficiency.



Fountaine, Lewerenz, Atwater Nature Communications (2016)



OINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS

MATERIALS SELECTION: CATALYST BENCHMARKING



McCrory et al, JACS 137 (2015) 4347; ibid 135 (2013) 16977

MATERIALS SELECTION: PHOTOELECTRODES



A.Polman, M. Knight, E.C. Garnett, B. Erhler and W.C. Sinke, Science (2016)



19.3% STH EFFICIENCY INTEGRATED PEC DEVICE



W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*



19.3% STH EFFICIENCY INTEGRATED PEC DEVICE





W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*



RAPID ADVANCES IN EFFICIENCY OF INTEGRATED STH PECs

Dual junction limiting efficiency



W.H. Cheng, M.H Richter, M.M May, J. Ohlmann, D. Lackner, F. Dimroth, T. Hannappel, H.A. Atwater, and H.J. Lewerenz, *ArXiv 2017*



INTEGRATED SOLAR FUELS GENERATORS

UNASSISTED WATER SPLITTING WITH BIPOLAR MEMBRANE AT 10% ENERGY CONVERSION EFFICIENCY



All earth-abundant electrocatalysts: NiO_x for OER in the KBi buffer and CoP_x for HER in 1.0 M H₂SO₄.

- > 1.0 cm², > 10% STH conversion efficiency, >100 hour stability was achieved using a tandem photoabsorber in a cell configuration that incorporates a bipolar membrane.
- The acid stable electrocatalyst, CoP, was successfully integrated into the cell.

Bipolar membrane:

- near-unity transference numbers for proton and hydroxide transport at relatively high operational current densities
- ~400-500 mV voltage loss due to ohmic resistance, water dissociation and water transport processes, further improvements can be made by incorporating water dissociation catalysts at the interface.

K. Sun, R. Liu, E. Verlage, N. S. Lewis, C. Xiang, E&ES (2016)

Solar-Driven Reduction of CO_2 to Formate at 10% Energy conversion Efficiency

Schematic illustration of the series connected photoanode and dark cathode for CO₂ reduction to formate



Best combination of catholyte and anolyte to achieve the lowest total overpotential for the device

Minimal product crossovers even at high formate concentration

- Photoanode: InGaP/GaAs/TiO₂/NiO_x at pH=14 electrolyte previously used for solar water-splitting.
- Dark cathode: Pd/C nanoparticles on Ti mesh in pH=8 bicarbonate solution achieved ≤ 100 mV overpotential and >94% Faradaic efficiency at 10 mA cm⁻².
- Bipolar membrane sustained the steady-state pH differential and minimized the product crossovers.

CX Xiang, et.al. ACS Energy Lett., 2016, 1, pp 764–770



Relative scale of emissions and potential uses for CO_2



Current emissions:

Some possible non-atmospheric ends:

GtC = 1 billion metric tons of carbon equivalent, i.e. 1Gt MeOH = 12.01/(12.01+16.00+4*1.01) Gt = 0.37 GtC.

¹Assuming cement is composed of CaCO3, and the aggregate is composed of 50% CaCO3 by mass - ²Assuming a steel substitute that is similar in composition to carbon fiber, i.e. 90% C by mass. ³ Assuming cement is composed of CaCO3 • ⁴ Estimated feasible scale-up rates by 2050, excluding geoengineering approaches. Shaded bars indicate the upper range of estimates.



THE CO₂ UTILIZATION LANDSCAPE

- Focus on processes able to capture, reduce or sequester 1 GtCO₂/yr scale
- 1 of the top 5 Priorities: Synthetic Transformations of CO₂
- Recommendations:
 - Reduce the cost of carbon-free/neutral energy in the form of heat/electricity
 - Focus on fundamentals of electrocatalysis and photoelectrocatalysis
 - Identify catalysts made of abundant elements that reduce the overpotentials for CO2RR and OER at high reaction rates.



Secretary of Energy Advisory Board Report, 12/13/2016



THE CO₂ UTILIZATION LANDSCAPE





ROUTES TO FUELS FROM CO₂: COMPARING APPROACHES



Advantages:

Mature technology; heat only required as energy input

Disadvantages:

High capital cost and intrinsically large-scale for plant; efficiency < 100% Room temperature operation, high FE and throughput for certain products (e.g., CO, HCOO⁻)

Limited throughput, low selectivity and STF efficiency for alkane and alcohol fuels Low capital cost, scalable, uses sunlight as direct energy input

Low efficiency and selectivity, product separation

Low capital cost; near room temperature; near neutral pH operation

Limited durability (bacteria die after 30 days); limited pH range, low throughput



Why not just make CO and H_2 and use thermochemistry to do the rest?

- High capital cost for thermochemical plant
- Fischer-Tropsch thermal conversion efficiency 50-60%
- Requires source of hydrogen using process other than steam reforming (PEC water splitting technology development ongoing)



Japanese Gas to Liquids Pilot Plant, Niigata City, Japan

Production scale: 500 barrels/day

JCAP aims for direct, selective CO_2R catalysis strategies under mild P & T conditions that have potential for scalable production of fuels from sunlight with low capital cost.

CHEMICAL SYNTHESES FROM SYNGAS AND METHANOL

- Many chemical conversions from syngas to products, including gasoline via Fischer-Tropsch
- Many chemical conversions from methanol to products, including gasoline
- Methanol is an achievable product from CO₂R PEC



Source: P.L. Spath and D.C. Dayton, Preliminary screening—technical and economic assessment of synthesis gas to fuels and chemicals with emphasis on the potential for biomas-derived syngas, National Renewable Energy Laboratory, NREL/TP-510-34929, December, 2003.





Kuhl, Cave, Abram, Jaramillo Energy Environ. Sci. 5, 7050 (2012).

Selectivity is a major issue: Competition with HER



IFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHESIS

Possible pathways for CO_2 reduction catalysis on copper



R. Kortlever, J. Shen, K-J P. Schouten, F. Calle-Vallejo, and M.T. M. Koper, J Phys Chem Lett., 6, 4073–4082 (2015).

Scaling relationships for CO_2 intermediates on CU



Adsorption energies of the key bound intermediates on fcc Cu (211)

Adsorption energies of adsorbates binding through oxygen

Peterson and Nørskov, J Phys Chem Lett., 3, 251–25 (2012).



SELECTIVE CO₂ REDUCTION

OVERCOMING SCALING RELATIONSHIPS FOR CO₂ REDUCTION



THEORY DEVELOPMENTS



H* (H₂O*/H₂O)

pH = 12

H. (H'0./H'0

W.A. Goddard et al., JACS, 2016, 138, 483-486.

W.A. Goddard et al. J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2015, 6, 4767-4778.

 C_2

C-



Electrochemical Interface and **Higher Order Methods** 100 $\varepsilon_{\rm diel}$ 50 Electrolyte Solute -50Interface -10035 25 40 30 Position (Å) K. Mathew and R.G. Hennig, 2016, https://arxiv.org/abs/1601.03346 Potential Difference [V] - H⁺ in 1 water laver · · H⁺ in 2 water lavers

 $- \cdot \mathbf{H}^+$ in 3 water layers

10

Position [A]

5

J.K. Nørskov et al., Chem. Phys. Lett., 2008, 466, 68-71.

- H⁺ in 3 water layers - MD

15





20

EXPERIMENTAL DEVELOPMENTS







ELECTROLYTE SELECTION: CHOICE OF CATION

Use of CsHCO₃ buffer increases FE to C₂₊ products (ethanol, ethylene) on Cu foil



-1.0 V vs RHE in CO₂-saturated 0.1 M MHCO₃

Singh, M. R.; Kwon, Y.; Lum, Y.; Ager, J. W.; Bell, A. T. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **2016**, 138, 13006–13012. Also: Murata, A.; Hori, Y. *Bull. Chem. Soc. Jpn.* **1991**, 64, 123–127.



Scientific Achievement

Identified tandem, bimetallic catalysts for the preferential formation of H_2COO over H_2 .

Significance and Impact

Selective reduction of CO_2 to H_2COO can be achieved by embedding metal atoms that favor CORR over HER in a host metal that favors CO_2 reduction to CO. The CORR catalyst must bind *CHO (or *COH) more tightly than *H

Research Details

DFT/RPBE/APW was used to calculate the free energy of activation for all elementary steps in CO2 reduction to CO on Au(111) or Ag(111) surfaces and the reduction of CO to H2CO vs H2 on Cu, Ni, Pd, Pt , Co, Rh, and Ir atoms embedded in the host metal surface.



M.-J. Cheng, A.T. Bell, and M. Head-Gordon, ACS Catal. 6, 7769–7777 (2016)

Electrode

Lid

Spacer

ELECTROCHEMICAL REDUCTION OF CO₂ SELECTIVELY TO METHANOL

Near-Surface Alloy for Selective Reduction of CO_2 to CH_3OH

A theoretical prediction: a near-surface alloy (NSA) of a monolayer of Au on bulk W was empirically found to generate CH_3OH to the *exclusion* of other hydrocarbons and alcohols.

Approach

- Combined density-functional theory and adsorptionenergy descriptors ΔG°_{CO} , ΔG°_{H} and ΔG°_{OH} predicted a Au-W-Au NSA that would be CH₃OH-product-selective.
- Overlayer NSA films of (0.5 to 3 ML) Au on W were prepared by controlled galvanostatic deposition.



Vacuum Cell body Membrane Steel frit 200 L/s 10⁻³ mba QMS 10⁻⁵ mbar Products from CO₂ reduction at -1.2 V(RHE) in 0.1 M KHCO₃ were analyzed by Differential **Electrochemical Mass Spectrometry (DEMS).** Only CH₂OH was found.

ELECTROCHEMICAL REDUCTION OF CO₂ SELECTIVELY TO METHANOL

Constant-potential DEMS of CO₂ Reduction on Au-W Near-Surface Alloy



Theoretical Prognosis	Experimental Result	Fut
CH ₃ OH-Selective	CH ₃ OH-Selective	Pre
High Activity	Not yet optimized	Try
Low Overvoltage	Not yet optimized	Ob
HER Suppression	Not yet optimized	Hav
High Activity Low Overvoltage HER Suppression	Not yet optimized Not yet optimized Not yet optimized Not yet optimized	T C F

Future Work:

Prepare NSA as prescribed by theory Try different substrates with the same NSA Obtain complete and quantitative product analysis Have theory scrutinized by other theory groups

A. Javier, J. H. Baricuatro, Y.-G. Kim and M. P. Soriaga^{*}. "Au-on-W Near-Surface Alloy as a CH₃OH-Product-Selective Electrocatalyst for CO₂ Reduction: Empirical (DEMS) Confirmation of a Computational (DFT) Prediction." *Electrocatalysis*, **6** 495. (2015).



Exp.: Kuhl, et al. JACS doi:10.1021/ja505791r (2014). Kuhl, Cave, Abram, Jaramillo, Energy & Environmental Science 5, 7050 (2012).



EPITAXIAL GROWTH USING PHYSICAL VAPOR DEPOSITION



D. B. Knorr and T.-M. Lu, *Textures and Microstructures*, **1991**, 13, 155-164.

B. G. Demczyk, R. Naik, G. Auner, C. Kota and U. Rao, *Journal of Applied Physics*, **1994**, 75, 1956-1961. I. Hashim, B. Park, and H.A. Atwater, *Applied Physics Letters*, **1993**, 63, 2833-2835.





C. Hahn, T. Hatsukade, Y.G. Kim, A. Vallionis, J.H. Baricuatro, D.C. Higgins, S. Nitopi, M.P. Soriaga and T.F. Jaramillo, PNAS, **2017**.

RTIFICIAL PHOTO

EFFECTS OF SURFACE STRUCTURE ON C-C COUPLING SELECTIVITY



C-C coupling is favored on under-coordinated sites. Epitaxial Cu thin films are single-crystal analogous for C-C coupling selectivity.

C. Hahn, T. Hatsukade, Y.G. Kim, A. Vallionis, J.H. Baricuatro, D.C. Higgins, S. Nitopi, M.P. Soriaga and T.F. Jaramillo, PNAS, **2017**.





Cu(751) has the lowest number of nearest neighbors, and is the least likely to have adsorbed H* adjacent to C2 intermediates. PCET instead of hydride transfer leads to less structure sensitivity.



OECSTM: CU RECONSTRUCTION AT CO₂R CONDITIONS (-0.9 V/0.1 M KOH)



Y.-G. Kim, J. H. Baricuatro, A. Javier and M. P. Soriaga, J.Electroanal. Chem. 780 pp 290-295 (2106)

REGULATING CO-REDUCTION SELECTIVITY BY CONTROL OF SURFACE STRUCTURE

Ethanol-product Selectivity of Post-ORC Cu(pc)-[Cu(100)] at -1.0 V in 0.1 M KOH





$CO-to-C_2H_5OH$ on Cu(511)





Y.-G. Kim, J. H. Baricuatro, A. Javier and M. P. Soriaga, J.Electroanal. Chem. 780 pp 290-295 (2106)

HIGH THROUGHPUT DISCOVERY OF PHOTOANODES

Electrocatalyst screening

Library

synthesis

Light-absorber screening

Characterization

Data informatics and distribution

Theory + HiTp Computation

1.0

0.8

Phase fraction 8.0

0.0

Blossite

0.50

Design Materials & Interface with MP Database

Joint project with the Materials Project to design photoanodes and identify candidate materials.



High Throughput Computation Judicious choice of functional to rapidly evaluate the electronic structure and Pourbaix stability of hundreds of materials

High Throughput Experimentation Identify synthesis conditions, generate composition maps of optical and photoelectrochemical properties.



L. Zhou, Q. Yan, A. Shinde, D. Guevarra, P. F. Newhouse, N. Becerra-Stasiewicz, J. B. Neaton, J. M. Gregoire, Adv. Energy Mater. 5, 1500968 (2015).

HIGH THROUGHPUT DISCOVERY OF PHOTOANODES: INTEGRATED THEORY-EXPERIMENT PIPELINE

Stitching complementary techniques together accelerates hypothesis-based discoveries



Pipeline execution summary:

- Out of the 15 hits there are 12 discoveries (3 of 15 were already reported)
- The 88% hit rate upon successful synthesis provides credence to the design criteria and the computational workflow
- These experimentally-verified predictions foundationally demonstrate that high throughput computation can accelerate experimental discovery of functional materials.



• Varying the electronic band character in complex oxides enables tuning of the band gap energy and band positions.

JOINT CENTER FOR ARTIFICIAL PHOTOSYNTHES

Q. Yan, et.al. (Persson, Gregoire, Neaton) PNAS, 114 3040-3043 (2017).

INTEGRATION

BIPHASIC OER CATALYST INTEGRATED ON SI



More $Co(OH)_2$ component increases with increasing photoelectron take-off angle \rightarrow surface layer:



Onset potential for water oxidation of <1V versus RHE and a saturation current density of 37.5 mA/cm²:



No detectable transfer of Co from the film into solution after 72 hr.

J. Yang, et.al. (Toma, Yano, Sharp) Nature Materials, 114 3040-3043 (2017).



PROTOTYPING

MEMBRANELESS FLOW CELL PROTOTYPE FOR SEPARATIONS



A new electrochemical CO_2 test bed implements isolates the fuel-containing electrolyte produced at the cathode from the anode and produces a stream of liquid products.

Cell design validated with 2-D Multiphysics modeling and experimentally implemented.

Separation efficiency as high as 90% demonstrated.

Monroe, M. M.; Lobaccaro, P.; Lum, Y.; Ager, J. W., J. Phys. D. Appl. Phys. 50, 154006 (2017).



Overall Faradaic efficiency (sum of both channels) for formate production with 01 M KHCO₃ electrolyte saturated in CO_2 and Sn cathode at 5 mA/cm².

Goulet, M.A.; Kjeang, E. *J. of Power Sources*. 2014, *260*, 186-196. Ismagilov, R.F.; Stroock, A.D.; Kenis, P.J.A.; et al. *Appl. Phys. Letters*. 2000, *76*, 2376-2378.



MULTIPHYSICS MODELING: VIRTUAL INTEGRATOR AND TESTING PLATFORM





- 20 mA/cm² is feasible with 1 atm CO₂ or equivalent high concentration locally
- For aqueous: pH 7.5 to 8.5 shows lowest total losses while maintaining selectivity towards CO₂ reduction

Key is local CO₂ concentration

M. R. Singh, E.L. Clark, A.T. Bell, doi: 10.1039/C5CP03283K



- A strategy for selective EC-CO₂ reduction: multifunctional cathode that combines multiple active sites, functional coatings, nanoscale confining volumes
- Mechanism discovery: initial focus predominantly on Cu and Cu alloys
- Materials discovery:
 - bimetallic alloy candidates screened and synthesized
 - oxide photoanode theory/experimental effort achieves high predictive yield
- Integration focus on OER (– biphasic cobalt oxide)
- **Prototyping**: device architectures for EC and PEC CO2RR

