

Office of ENERGY EFFICIENCY & RENEWABLE ENERGY

# **Emerging Lighting Science**



Pacific Northwest National LaboratoryDr. Robert DavisDr. Michael Royerrobert.davis@pnnl.govmichael.royer@pnnl.gov

PNNL-SA-142459

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY OFFICE OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY & RENEWABLE ENERGY

# **Project Summary**

#### Timeline:

Start date: 10/1/2018 (new scope for ongoing work) Planned end date: 9/30/2021

#### Deliverables expected for FY19

- 1. Six journal papers (submitted)
- 2. Six technical reports (incl. energy impacts study)
- 3. LightFair, EDRA, IALD, CIE, IES, other conference presentations and webinars

### Budget:

#### Total Project \$ to Date:

- DOE: \$5069k
- Cost Share: \$0

#### **Total Project \$:**

- DOE: \$10069k
- Cost Share: \$0

#### Key Partners:

| GA Tech/SimTigrate          | Emory Univ. Hospital      |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Univ. of KY Hospital        | Univ. of Oregon           |
| Renton WA Schools           | Penn State Univ.          |
| Folsom Cordova<br>Schools   | Harvard Medical<br>School |
| Boulder Community<br>Health | Univ. of Colorado         |

#### Project Goals & Outcomes:

This project seeks to answer key questions about the energy implications of emerging science on how light affects human needs; the ways in which lighting can be designed to support these needs while minimizing energy use; and how future SSL systems can be optimized to minimize energy use while maximizing the desired human benefits in these applications. This project supports the Building Technologies Office goal to reduce lighting energy use intensity by 30% by 2030.

# Challenge

**Problem Definition:** 

- Traditional approaches to lighting energy efficiency have focused exclusively on optimizing lighting systems for *human visual performance*
  - Basis for the related design metrics and DOE targets for SSL technology
- Emerging research indicates that future lighting technologies and applications will need to serve *holistic needs* that go beyond visual performance
  - Improved color quality, control of glare, avoidance of flicker, consideration of circadian rhythms, and provision of acute alerting effects
  - Economic valuation of these non-energy impacts may affect lighting energy use
- Design metrics and lighting technologies that are optimized for visual performance are *not optimal for these holistic needs*, which could threaten the ability to meet DOE's energy use reduction goals for buildings

**PROJECT GOAL:** Support energy use intensity reduction goals for buildings with research that helps ensure that future generations of lighting technologies and future lighting design metrics are optimized to support new demands for lighting while minimizing the energy used

## Approach



A transition from human visual needs to more holistic goals may mean:

- increased energy use intensity (EUI) due to higher light levels and /or
- slower EUI reductions due to sub-optimal metrics and technologies

Research that *optimizes* the metrics and technology, and that increases perceived *value* of the benefits of future technology improvements, directly supports BTO goals.

## **Approach: Four Task Areas and Purposes**

- **1. ENERGY:** How will the emerging science of human effects of light affect U.S. building energy use?
  - optimization & valuation of future SSL technology
- 2. VISUAL: What knowledge is needed to optimize future generations of SSL systems for minimizing energy use while providing the appropriate light for human visual needs?
  - color, flicker, glare, optical materials
- 3. NON-VISUAL: What knowledge is needed to optimize future generations of SSL systems for minimizing energy use while providing the appropriate light for human non-visual needs?
  - metrics, simulations
- **4. REALISTIC SETTINGS:** How valid are research results found in controlled laboratory studies when applied to realistic, complex environments
  - healthcare, education, offices



Higher light levels?

#### **Swedish Medical Behavioral Health Unit**



Light levels are more than double the recommendations for visual task needs due to circadian stimulus design goals





Light level and spectrum varies over 24 hour cycle

vs. recommended light level base case: 19-42% energy increase



Simulation Studies: Open office with neutral finishes and wood furniture

- 5000 ft<sup>2</sup>; 40 workstations; 40 tunable 2x2 luminaires; baseline condition meets IES visual reqts.
- Comparisons to evaluate Equivalent Melanopic Lux (EML) as specified in WELL Building Certifications, using the Adaptive Lighting for Alertness (ALFA) software



| SPD   | %<br>output | Ave<br>Lux <sub>v</sub> | Ave<br>EML <sub>v</sub> | WELL<br>v2 1a | Annual<br>kWh1 | Annual<br>kWh2 |
|-------|-------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------|----------------|----------------|
| 3800K | 40          | 160                     | 90                      | NO            | 1910           |                |
| 3800K | 100         | 390                     | 250                     | NO            | 8080           |                |
| 2700K | 100         | 390                     | 160                     | NO            | 8080           |                |
| 6200K | 100         | 390                     | 330                     | YES           | 8080           | 3710           |
|       |             |                         |                         |               |                |                |

#### <u>Analysis 1: Tunable System</u> (Current Technology)

**Higher light levels?** 

- IES requires 150 lx vertical
- WELL v2 1a requires 240 EML electric light at all workstations for maximum points
- kWh1 assumes 5000 hrs./year
- kWh2 assumes high intensity for 4 hrs./day per WELL
- WELL requires at least a 94% increase in annual energy use

#### <u>Analysis 2: Spectral Optimization (Future</u> <u>Technology)</u>

- Luminous efficacy of radiation (LER) analyses show what can be achieved by future technology with optimized spectral power distribution (SPD)
- Optimal SPD has 5.2% higher LER than 6200K for similar EML, at lower CCT
- Direct energy analyses not possible until incorporated into commercial luminaires

| SPD       | %<br>output | Ave<br>Lux <sub>v</sub> | Ave<br>EML <sub>v</sub> | WELL<br>v2 1a | LER |
|-----------|-------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------|-----|
| 3800K     | 40          | 160                     | 90                      | NO            | 316 |
| 6200K     | 40          | 160                     | 130                     | NO            | 310 |
| Lo M/P    | 40          | 160                     | 75                      | NO            | 332 |
| Hi M/P    | 40          | 160                     | 125                     | NO            | 260 |
| Optimized | 40          | 160                     | 130                     | NO            | 326 |

High quality color rendition has traditionally required sacrifices in efficiency – but new metrics coupled with future technology optimizations can enable high efficiency and high color quality



+6% Spectral Efficiency +21% Spectral Efficiency +26% Spectral Efficiency

Sub-optimal metrics & spectra?



#### **Color Rendering Specification**

Royer, Michael. 2019. Evaluating tradeoffs between energy efficiency and color rendition. Under review at *Optics Express.* 

### Legacy CRI metric

- Increasing from 80 to 90 reduces LER<sub>max</sub> by 6.0%
- No basis in preference

### IES TM-30 metrics

- Increasing from C to B reduces  ${\sf LER}_{\sf max}$  by 2.6%
- Increasing from C to A reduces  ${\rm LER}_{\rm max}$  by 5.5%
- LER<sub>max</sub> for TM-30 A is higher than for CRI = 90
- Grounded in emerging science on preference
- "Green gap" and red remain key aspects for color rendition & energy efficiency



Valuation of lighting quality: 23 experts evaluated 7 hi-bay LED luminaires

- Assessed mock-up installation for visual comfort, distribution of light, color quality, appearance
- Rankings derived from written comments
- Value assigned by experts based on average price

|                          | # LEDs   | Rank | \$ Value | lm/W |
|--------------------------|----------|------|----------|------|
|                          | Diffuser | 1    | \$230    | 136  |
|                          | 1080     | 2    | \$196    | 165  |
|                          | 2862     | 3    | \$192    | 158  |
|                          | 576      | 4    | \$191    | 177  |
|                          | 672      | 5    | \$174    | 162  |
| ທາງອາດຸດຸດອາດຸດ<br>ທີ່ມີ | 756      | 6    | \$173    | 200  |
|                          | 536      | 7    | \$168    | 167  |

Miller, NM, T Beeson, J McIntosh, S Safranek. *Top Efficacy Performers: An investigation into high-achieving LED luminaires*. PNNL-27648, 2018.



If this type of luminaire costs \$200 on average, what would you pay for this one?

| □ \$100        | □ \$250 |
|----------------|---------|
| □ <b>\$150</b> |         |
| □ \$200        | □ \$300 |



### Task 1: Energy

**Valuation** 

Developed a three-stage project to formally address the valuation of non-energy impacts and the expected effects that those valuations will have on lighting energy use:

- 1. Develop *descriptions* of baseline, near- and far-term future advanced luminaire scenarios for use in economic valuation
  - Future scenarios incorporate results of PNNL research in optimization of metrics and technology
  - Streetlights/glare; Streetlights/environmental
  - Office/flicker; Office/non-visual effects (tunable); LED lamps/color rendition
  - Completed
- 2. Estimate the *value* of advanced luminaires expected to result from PNNL research, using methodologies developed to help quantify "non-energy impacts (NEI)" of energy efficiency programs for electric utilities
  - Subcontract with Skumatz Economic Research Associates, SERA
  - completion 6/10/19
- 3. Estimate future potential *energy savings* that are expected to result from the research planned by PNNL using valuation inputs from SERA to an established lighting cost/market model
  - Subcontract with Navigant
  - completion 8/30/19



#### Example information for valuation exercise – home LED lamps; color rendering

| COLLOQUIAL DESCRIPTION  | TECHNICAL DESCRIPTION  |
|---|--|
| Color rendering similar to that provided by good<br>quality fluorescent luminaires. The lighting makes<br>colors look somewhat dull and unnatural and whites<br>may have a slight yellowish tint; the light itself may<br>have a slight greenish tint.  | CIE R <sub>a</sub> 80-84 and CIE R <sub>9</sub> 0-20. LER 330  |
| <u>Near-term Performance:</u> The lighting makes colors<br>look natural, but some colors are a little bit dull.<br>Whites are untinted. Energy efficiency increases by<br>approximately 10% versus baseline. No change in<br>price.                     | IES TM-30-18 $R_f \ge 75$ , $R_g \ge 95$ , $R_{cs,h1} \ge -7\%$ , $R_{cs,h1} \le 15\%$<br>Future whiteness index.<br>Future updates to chromaticity.<br>LER 365                    |
| <u>Long-term Performance:</u> The lighting makes colors<br>look vibrant and pleasing. Whites are crisp and clean.<br>The light is an untinted neutral white. Energy<br>efficiency increases by approximately 20% versus<br>baseline. No change in cost. | IES TM-30-18 R <sub>f</sub> ≥ 78, R <sub>g</sub> ≥ 95, R <sub>cs,h1</sub> ≥ -1%, R <sub>cs,h1</sub> ≤ 15%<br>Future whiteness index.<br>Future updates to chromaticity.<br>LER 400 |



- Complete energy estimates based on valuation of non-energy impacts
- Continue with simulations for energy estimates based on WELL Standard
  - Testing effects of different variables: finishes, directions, etc.
  - Expand to other applications: healthcare, education, etc.
  - Document and publish results in peer-reviewed building energy journals
- Translate optimization targets into estimated electrical energy implications
- Final summary report completed by 9/30/2019

## Task 2 Visual :: Approach



# Task 2 Visual :: Approach



# Task 2 Visual :: Color

#### GOALS

- Establish psychophysically-relevant color metrics
- Generate structure and guidance to enable technology transformation
- Ensure SSL is chosen for quality and efficiency, with simultaneous improvement vs. current

### PROGRESS

- ANSI/IES TM-30-18; Annexes E & F pending
- "Analysis of color rendition specification criteria." SPIE 2019.
- "Experimental validation of color rendition specification criteria based on ANSI/IES TM-30-18." LR&T. Submitted for publication.
- "Evaluating Tradeoffs between energy efficiency and color rendition." Optics Express. Submitted for Publication.
- "A vector field color rendition model for characterizing color shifts and metameric mismatch." Leukos 2019.

More: https://www.energy.gov/eere/ssl/color-rendition

#### FUTURE

- Outfit new laboratory facility to continue psychophysical experiments; investigate refinements of and additions to newlydeveloped metrics
- Conduct experiments using physiological outcome measures to validate subjective responses
- Develop methods for optimizing SPDs for reduced absorption by colored objects
- Investigate updates to definitions of CCT and D<sub>uv</sub> to align with perception



## Task 2 Visual :: Color



166 SPDs from psychophysical experiments conducted at PNNL Arranged in rank order based on mean ratings of color preference

1 Recommended specifications pending inclusion in ANSI / IES TM-30-18 as Annex E Pending implementation by DesignLights Consortium and WELL Building Standard Color Preference 1:  $R_{\rm f} \ge 78$ ,  $R_{\rm g} \ge 95$ ,  $-1\% \le R_{\rm cs,h1} \le 15\%$ Color Preference 2:  $R_{\rm f} \ge 74$ ,  $R_{\rm g} \ge 92$ ,  $-7\% \le R_{\rm cs,h1} \le 15\%$ Color Preference 3:  $R_{\rm f} \ge 70$ ,  $R_{\rm g} \ge 89$ ,  $-12\% \le R_{\rm cs,h1} \le 15\%$ 

#### **KEY IMPACT:**

New specs clearly outperform old and will better guide product development and specification.

### Task 2 Visual :: Color

Royer, Michael P. "Evaluating Tradeoffs between energy efficiency and color rendition." Optics Express. Submitted for peer review.



LER (lumens/Watt<sub>optical</sub>) represents potential if electrical efficiency fully addressed.

#### **KEY IMPACT:**

- Established relationships between LER and new measures of color rendition
- Using new Color Preference specs enables higher LER<sub>max</sub> by avoiding strong tradeoff with high fidelity

# Task 2 Visual :: Glare

#### GOALS

- Contribute updates to Unified Glare Rating (UGR)
- Establish tool and guidance to enable lighting stakeholders to mitigate glare when necessary
- Help to improve quality of SSL luminaires while limiting unnecessary energy efficiency tradeoffs

### PROGRESS

- "HDRI for luminance measurement: A review of sources of error." Leukos. Submitted for publication.
- Designed apparatus for evaluating glare perception over field of view

### FUTURE

- Human factors experiment to extend and validate the position index, an important component of UGR
- Human factors experiment on contribution of spectral power distribution to glare perception



# **Task 2 Visual :: Optical Materials**

### GOALS

- Develop measure of luminance uniformity for diffusing materials to improve luminaire design
- Document tradeoffs between transmission and obscuration to enable selection of most efficient materials



### PROGRESS

- Conducted outreach to optical materials companies to establish research priorities
- Designed new apparatus for evaluating visual uniformity of diffusing elements
- Created taxonomy of materials, obtained samples

### FUTURE

- Comparison of HDR and luminance meter measurements of spatial luminance patterns
- Human factors study of uniformity perception
- Evaluation of long-term stability for LED luminaire optical components



## **Task 4 Realistic Settings :: Approach**



## **Task 4 Realistic Settings :: Approach**



# **Task 4 Realistic Settings :: Patient Rooms**

### GOALS

- Optimize patient room lighting for reduced EUI while meeting needs of caregivers, patients, guests
- Build on results from "DOE-inside" R&D effort
- Establish accepted evidence base for new healthcare design standards that can inform future technology solutions

### PROGRESS

- Commissioned mock-up room at SimTigrate GA Tech
- Completed journal paper on nurse survey results
- Completed 1<sup>st</sup> experiment at SimTigrate (nurses)
- Designed 2<sup>nd</sup> experiment at SimTigrate (patients +)
- Identified "simulation" room in Emory Midtown

### FUTURE

- Publish series of peer-reviewed journal papers to build the evidence base for new metrics
- Coordinate design and installation of researchoriented lighting system in sim room at Emory
- Seek similar opportunities at other hospitals

#### Georgia | SimTigrate Tech ∦ Design Lab





H E A L T H C A R E

EMC





# **Task 4 Realistic Settings :: Classrooms**

### GOALS

- Optimize classroom lighting for reduced EUI while meeting needs of students and teachers
- Build on results from "DOE-inside" R&D effort
- Establish accepted evidence base for new classroom design standards that can inform future technology solutions

### PROGRESS

- Completed CFB and FCU Phase 1 (FY18)
- Prepared and delivered webinar for BBA members
- Completed FCUSD Phase 2 Report (March 2019)
- Completed article for LD+A magazine
- Established relationship with Renton WA district

### FUTURE

- Presentation on FCUSD project at LightFair 2019
- Develop technical paper for peer-reviewed journal on CFB and FCUSD
- Develop project plans for Renton Schools, possible collaboration with Harvard Medical School











# Task 4 Realistic Settings :: Work in progress

### GOALS

- Focus on high EUI and/or high energy use applications, especially those where design metrics are in transition
- Contribute to optimization of metrics and technology and valuation of NEI to support EUI goals
- Leverage DOE funding through collaborations

### PROGRESS

- Delivered IES webinar on health metrics
- Completed initial data analysis for U of KY NICU; several conference presentations completed
- Completed Phase 1 of Boulder Community Health (BCH) research project; collaboration with Harvard Medical School for data
- Engaged on design and research team for Emory MCI facility and research program
- Supported DOE-funded research project at Suburban Hospital with Uniformed Services Univ.
- Established collaboration with Brown Univ. for Phase 2 research at ACC Care Center
- Collaborations on HDRI and virtual reality (VR) research with U of CO and U of OR

### **FUTURE**

- Workshop and seminars at LightFair, EDRA, IES
- Complete analyses, reports, papers on UK, BCH, other current projects
- Initiate new collaborative efforts to address gaps in evidence base for optimization and valuation















## Team



#### **Bob Davis**

Technical Director MS, Arch Eng PhD, Psychology 30+ yrs lighting 6 yrs PNNL Fellow IES



Michael Royer Task Leader, Visual MAE & PhD, Arch Eng Human Factors Color science 8 yrs PNNL



Andrea Wilkerson

Task Leader, Nonvisual & Realistic Settings MS & PhD, Arch Eng Human factors 6 yrs PNNL



**Jessica Collier** MFA, Lighting Design Human factors PNNL associate 2019



Alp Durmus MS, Arch Lighting PhD, Architecture Human factors Color science PNNL post-doc 2019



Kelly Gordon Program Manager MPP, Public Policy Team Leader, Advanced Lighting

19 yrs PNNL



Marc Ledbetter Economics, Energy 30+ yrs energy efficiency 25+ yrs PNNL



Naomi Miller MS, Lighting Flicker, Glare expert 30+ yrs lighting 10 yrs PNNL Fellow IES, IALD



#### Sarah Safranek

MS, Arch Eng HDRI, Simulations 2 yrs PNNL

## Impact: Project deliverables from 10/1/18-present

#### Journal and conference papers

- Perceived colour fidelity under LEDs with similar  $R_{f}$  but different  $R_{a}$ , published in LR&T, Jan 2019
- A vector field color rendition model for characterizing color shifts and metameric mismatch, published in LEUKOS, Jan 2019
- Analysis of color rendition specification criteria, published in Proc of Light-Emitting Devices, Materials, and Applications, SPIE, Mar 2019
- Lighting research today (guest editor editorial), accepted by LEUKOS, Mar 2019
- HDRI for luminance measurement, submitted to LEUKOS, Dec 2018
- Nurse satisfaction with patient room lighting, draft submitted to DOE, Mar 2019
- Evaluating tradeoffs between energy efficiency and color rendition, submitted to Optics Express, Mar 2019
- Experimental validation of color rendition specification criteria based on ANSI/IES TM-30-18, submitted to LR&T, Mar 2019

#### Technical reports

- Characterizing photometric flicker. Nov 2018
- Evaluating tunable lighting in classrooms Supplemental Report. Feb 2019

#### **Presentations**

- Top performers high-bay project, DOE webinar, Oct 2018
- Light and health seminar, LightShow West, Los Angeles CA, Oct 2018
- Spectral and energy simulations, Solemma Symposium, Ithaca NY, Oct 2018
- Tunable lighting studies, DOE R&D Workshop, Dallas TX, Jan 2019
- Circadian metrics, IES Metrics in Motion Series, IES webinar, Feb 2019
- Color rendition specifications, SPIE Photonics West, Feb 2019
- UK NICU tunable lighting, Gravens Conference, Orlando FL, March 2019

## Impact



- Research on emerging lighting science in visual and non-visual effects, with confirmation in realistic settings, supports optimized metrics and design targets for future lighting technology, and contributes to proper valuation of the non-energy benefits of lighting
- Without this research, lighting may not fully contribute to the 30% EUI reduction goals of BTO by 2030

# Acronyms

- ALFA Adaptive Lighting for Alertness (software)
- ANSI American National Standards Institute
- BTO Building Technologies Office
- CCT Correlated Color Temperature
- CFB Carrolton Farmers Branch school district
- CIE International Lighting Commission (French initials)
- CRI Color Rendering Index
- EDRA Environmental Design Research Association
- EML Equivalent Melanopic Lux
- EUI Energy Use Intensity
- FCUSD Folsom Cordova Unified School District
- HDRI High Dynamic Range Imaging
- IALD International Association of Lighting Designers
- IEEE Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers
- IES Illuminating Engineering Society
- ISO International Organization for Standardization
- LER Luminous Efficacy of Radiation (lumens produced per optical watt of radiation)
- NEI Non-Energy Impacts
- NEMA National Electrical Manufacturers Association
- TM-30 Technical Memorandum 30 (a color metrics document published by the IES)
- USGBC United States Green Building Council

# **Thank You**

Pacific Northwest National Laboratory Dr. Robert Davis, Technical Director 503-417-7572 robert.davis@pnnl.gov

## **REFERENCE SLIDES**

# **Project Budget**

#### **Project Budget**

**Variances:** Original planned budget was \$2500k per year for 3 years. In year 1, budget was increased due to:

- Increased volume of research opportunities within scope
  - Visual phenomena research
  - Realistic settings research
- Decreased scope in Application Specific Lighting project allowed for budget shift to Emerging Lighting Science project

# **Cost to Date**: as of March 2019 month end, \$1399k cumulative cost to date **Additional Funding**: None

| Budget History    |            |                    |            |                                |            |  |  |  |
|-------------------|------------|--------------------|------------|--------------------------------|------------|--|--|--|
| FY 2018<br>(past) |            | FY 2019* (current) |            | FY 2020 – FY 2021<br>(planned) |            |  |  |  |
| DOE               | Cost-share | DOE                | Cost-share | DOE                            | Cost-share |  |  |  |
| n/a               |            | \$5069k            |            | \$5000k                        |            |  |  |  |

\*Note: Includes FY2018 carry-over funds

## **Project Plan and Schedule**

| Project Schedule  |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
|---|--------------|--|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| Project Start: 10/1/2018  |              | Completed Work                                   |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Projected End: 9/30/2021  |              | Active Task (in progress work)                   |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
|   | •            | Milestone/Deliverable (Originally planned) use   |              |              |              |              |              |              | e for        | mis          |              |              |
|   | •            | Milestone/Deliverable (Actual) use when met on t |              |              |              |              |              |              |              | me           |              |              |
|   |              | FY19 FY20 F                                      |              |              |              |              |              | FY2          | :Y21         |              |              |              |
| Emerging Lighting Science   | Q1 (Oct-Dec) | Q2 (Jan-Mar)                                     | Q3 (Apr-Jun) | Q4 (Jul-Sep) | Q1 (Oct-Dec) | Q2 (Jan-Mar) | Q3 (Apr-Jun) | Q4 (Jul-Sep) | Q1 (Oct-Dec) | Q2 (Jan-Mar) | Q3 (Apr-Jun) | Q4 (Jul-Sep) |
| Past Work   |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Journal paper related to SSL and human physiological effects of light                             |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Journal paper related to SSL and human visual responses   |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Current/Future Work   |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Report on energy impacts of human physiological applications                                      |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Go/no-go decision based on projected energy impact  |              |  |              | <            |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Status report on current laboratory and field evaluation projects                                 |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Journal paper submitted on a topic related to human visual response                               |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Report on a completed laboratory or field evaluation project                                      |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Journal paper submitted on a topic related to human non-visual responses                          |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Evaluation report comparing modeled to measured data from a field site                            |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              | •            |              |              |              |
| Journal paper submitted on a topic related to human visual response                               |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Journal paper submitted on a topic related to human non-visual responses                          |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              | •            |              |              |
| Report on a completed laboratory or field evaluation project                                      |              |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              | •            |              |
| Recommendations for future SSL technology developments related to human visual and non-visual end | ffects       |  |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |              |